Workshop 03
Evaluation criteria

EPA PCE 2024

Rony Rodrigo Maximiliano Rodriguez-Ramirez

rrodriguezramirez@g.harvard.edu

https://calendly.com/rrmaximiliano/30min

Harvard University

October 8, 2024

Introduction

Welcome to the Policy Analysis Workshop!

Today, we will focus on **Step 4** from Bardach and Patashnik's *A Practical Guide for Policy Analysis* (2020):

4. **Select the Criteria**

Agenda

Step 4: Select the Criteria

- Understanding Criteria

- Types of Criteria

- Selecting and Defining Criteria

- Weighting Criteria

Step 4: Select the Criteria

Understanding Criteria

- **Criteria:** Standards used to evaluate the potential outcomes of each alternative.

- **Purpose:** Bridge analytic facts and evaluative judgments.

> *"Criteria are evaluative standards used to judge the goodness of the projected policy outcomes."*
> — Bardach & Patashnik, 2020, p. 53

Types of Criteria

1. **Evaluative Criteria:**

   - Standards to assess desirability (e.g., efficiency, equity).

2. **Practical Criteria:**

   - Considerations related to implementation (e.g., legality, political acceptability).

Common Evaluative Criteria

- **Efficiency:** Maximizing resources to achieve goals.

- **Effectiveness:** Degree to which objectives are met.

- **Equity:** Fairness in distribution of benefits and burdens.

- **Political Acceptability:** Support from stakeholders and policymakers.

Example: Criteria for Reducing Achievement Gaps

1. **Primary Criterion:**

   - **Effectiveness:** Significant reduction in achievement gaps.

2. **Secondary Criteria:**

   - **Cost-Effectiveness:** Optimal use of budget resources.

   - **Equity:** Fair distribution of resources among all student demographics.

   - **Political Feasibility:** Support from key stakeholders.

Selecting and Defining Criteria

Steps to Define Criteria

1. **Primary Criterion:** Directly addresses the core problem.

2. **Secondary Criteria:** Additional factors influencing desirability.

Define Metrics

Criterion	Metric
Efficiency	Cost per student improvement
Effectiveness	Percentage decrease in achievement gaps
Equity	Distribution of resources across demographics
Political Acceptability	Level of stakeholder support

Avoiding Common Mistakes

- **Do Not Confuse Alternatives with Criteria:**

    $\rightarrow$ Alternatives are actions; criteria are standards for evaluation.

> *"Alternatives are courses of action, whereas criteria are mental standards for evaluating the results of action."*
> — Bardach & Patashnik, 2020, p. 69

Weighting Criteria

- **Relative Importance:** Assign weights based on policy goals.
- **Balancing Values:** Prioritize criteria based on overarching values.

Approaches to Weighting

1. **Political Process:**
   - Let existing frameworks determine weights.
2. **Analyst Imposition:**
   - Adjust weights to reflect fairness and underrepresented interests.

Practical Application

- **Group Separately:**

  → Positive (benefit) criteria vs. Negative (cost) criteria.

- **Specify Metrics:**

  → Ensure clarity and measurability.

- **Focus on Relevance:**

  → Criteria should align with policy objectives.

Group Exercise:

Topic: Selecting Evaluation Criteria

Task:

- **Scenario:** Evaluating alternatives to improve digital literacy in schools.

- **In Groups:**

    1. Identify and list potential criteria.

    2. Define clear metrics for each criterion.

    3. Assign relative weights to each criterion.

Share Your Findings: Each group presents their criteria and metrics.

Conclusion

- **Assembling Evidence:**

  → Critical for understanding and framing the problem.

- **Constructing Alternatives:**

  → Generates viable policy options.

- **Selecting Criteria:**

  → Ensures objective and value-driven evaluations.

Reminders

Reminders

- **Share your Feedback**: https://bit.ly/4dLGile

- Workshop #3 - 10/9 (Following Wed)

    → Read Bardach Pg 147-155 (different levers) & Recap Pg 31 - 49

    → Confirm your 3-5 alternatives

    → Pre-select at least 3 distinct criteria to bring for discussion in workshop

- **Next Assignment**: Education Sector Analysis, Problem Definition, Policy Alternatives & Evaluation Criteria (Group Assignment, Due 10/21 Noon) [Complete/Incomplete